

NOVEMBER 6, 2014

Members Present

Susan Stilwell
Michael Nicholas
Robert Weir
Sean Davis
Robin Crews

Members Absent

Sarah Latham

Staff

Renee Burton
Shanta Hairston
Jeannise Galloway

Chairman Stilwell called the meeting to order at 3:34 p.m.

ITEMS FOR PUBLIC HEARING

1. Request for approval of the Old West End Design Guidelines.

Mrs. Burton stated we have some additional comments that went back and forth on email.

Mr. Nicholas stated I don't think there should be any prohibited examples or prevented examples in the guidelines. I think the purpose of this is to create that two-step approval process, so we absolutely should put in there that vinyl or whatever does not meet the standard. That's clear. But the second part of allowing for the possibility of the use of vinyl in the right set of circumstances the burden being on the applicant, we should allow for and so we should not have in there an example that that would be prohibited. It is within the guidelines and it should be, but we can't say that it would be prohibited in 100% of the cases. That was why I made the suggestion that that be removed.

Mrs. Stilwell stated I have one other suggestion. I just want to make sure that we don't lead somebody astray thinking well it said in there that I could have vinyl windows.

Mr. Nicholas stated and if it says that then it shouldn't .

Mrs. Stilwell stated I want to make sure it does not say you know cart blanche approval for vinyl windows. I think there's certain circumstances that it may have to be considered and may be appropriate. There are some windows that are absolutely not visible from anywhere in some situations, but I don't want to give anybody the wrong idea about vinyl windows.

Mrs. Burton stated and I know we talked about this some in the last meeting.

Mrs. Crews stated in section three page 12 second bullet it says the use of modern materials can be reviewed on a case by case basis with the exception of vinyl

allowed. I think which are not allowed needs to be

Mr. Nicholas stated right, that needs to be removed.

Mrs. Crews stated section three page 12 the second bullet.

Mr. Nicholas stated that says that we can decide based on case by case but never on vinyl windows.

Mr. Davis stated this is with the whole intent that today vinyl windows are not accepted but in ten years.

Mr. Nicholas stated I can't think of an application for vinyl windows from this board where if it's visible from my public right of way that I think I'd want to approve.

Mr. Davis stated right, today.

Mr. Nicholas stated today. But since we only do this once every ten years and we're moving towards hey if you think of a way to do this that hasn't been done before then bring it to us and let's see. That's fine. I do not think it should say yes vinyl windows are acceptable.

Mrs. Burton stated so remove any language that's in the guidelines that prohibits a specific material, are we in consensus?

Mr. Nicholas stated it's fine to say that vinyl windows do not meet the guidelines because they don't.

Mrs. Stilwell stated and I think you should say because they are not true divided light.

Mr. Nicholas stated that's fine. We can say that. What we're not going to say is that they're cart blanche prohibited and can never be considered. Remember we're going to take two votes from now on. The first vote is do they meet the guidelines; that will always be no they don't meet the guidelines. The second vote, despite not meeting the guidelines, have you met the burden of maintaining the historical aesthetic with this proposal so we'd allow it. We would allow for that possibility.

Mrs. Burton stated there's another section that says prohibited materials include. I know that's in there and it will say vinyl siding. So is that something that we want to keep in here or do you think even that is something that could be in the future?

Mr. Nicholas stated to say that vinyl siding does not meet the guidelines is correct. To say that vinyl siding will never be approved is not correct in my opinion.

Mrs. Burton stated so we will remove as long as we're in consensus.

bit, vinyl siding does not meet the guidelines.

Mrs. Crews stated that would be section four page three is only one example of that.

Mrs. Burton stated okay I am with you. Are there other changes?

Mr. Nicholas stated those are the ones I have.

Mrs. Burton asked are we all comfortable with the two-step process?

The Commissioners all agreed by stating yes.

Mrs. Stilwell stated we've struggled at times. Either the house was going to fall down or we had to approve something that we don't love.

Mrs. Crews stated the other is not allowed. I am giving specifics. Prohibited or not allowed bullet seven page five in section three.

Mr. Nicholas stated you can leave them in there just change the wording to does not meet the design guidelines. Because Susan's absolutely right. You don't want to give the impression that we can use vinyl now.

Mrs. Burton stated right.

Mrs. Stilwell stated and I will say that I detest vinyl siding. But I'd tell you when I came to CAR and when we took down the garage that leaned to the very rear of our 275 feet deep lot, we did wood siding on the sides and the front but the back was three feet off the lot line and it was not visible from a public right of way. It may be if Keith Walden gets to tear down all those trees, but you couldn't get to it. It was too far overgrown. It was approved for me to do that rear in vinyl siding.

Mrs. Burton stated okay.

Chairman Stilwell opened the Public Hearing.

Mr. Gus Dyer was present.

Mr. Dyer stated that's actually serendipitous because I wasn't coming to this meeting I was actually coming to see Kenny for something and he goes are you here for the CAR meeting? I said no are you having one? He goes yeah. I will agree with your principle behind it because you don't know if five years from now what the building industry's going to come up with. They might come up with a true divided light vinyl or some kind of composite that includes vinyl. So I think that's correct. I don't want to toot my own horn, but I used vinyl siding on my condos and it's very thick, like cedar shakes. I've had tons of people come by and go I really like your Hardie Board. And I go it's not Hardie Board, it's vinyl siding. And I never have to paint it. So I will say on a particular

touch it, if it's on the third floor or something like something like that. I think you all are doing a good job changing it. I do think that the two-step process on like the River District Guidelines and things, is a good process. You don't know what's coming up.

Mr. Nicholas stated actually on this too, if question one is yes then there is no second vote about the guidelines.

Mrs. Burton stated Gus serves on our Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mr. David Corp was present on behalf of the item.

Mr. Corp said I sent you comments on this.

Mrs. Burton asked you sent me comments?

Mr. Corp stated I sent you comments a month ago about some repetitive parts in the document.

Mrs. Burton stated yes we did go through that.

Mr. Corp stated I think that's the only thing that really jumped out at me. I too like the two vote process.

Mrs. Burton stated great.

Mrs. Stilwell stated I love all the pictures. They tell the story that needs to be told.

Mrs. Burton stated such an advancement from what we had.

Chairman Stilwell closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Nicholas made a motion to approve the guidelines with the amendments made as of today by the Commissioners. Mr. Weir seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a 5-0 vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Dyer discussed his plan to start reconstructing houses in the Historic District that are currently on the City's demolition list.

With no further business the meeting adjourned at 3:52 p.m.

Approved