

COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

July 28, 2016

Members Present

Michael Nicholas
Susan Stilwell
Robert Weir
Sean Davis
Robert Stowe

Members Absent

Jeffrey Bond
Robin Crews

Staff

Renee Burton
Alan Spencer
Anna Levi
Tracie Lancaster

Chairman Nicholas called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m.

ITEMS FOR PUBLIC HEARING

1. *Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness, PLCAR2016000197, filed by Lawrence Meder to complete the following at 407 Chestnut Street:*

- *Construct an 8' x 16' uncovered deck on the right side of house.*
- *Install stain glass window above side door. No window currently exists in the space.*
- *Install conventional gutters*

Mr. Nicholas opened the Public Hearing.

Present on behalf of this request was Lawrence Meder, the applicant. Mr. Meder stated I'm busy working on the house at 407 Chestnut. I would like to invite you all out to come and see it. I am there almost every day and if I'm not I'm within three houses. The deck was previously approved for four foot wide and after disassembling that entire kitchen space and installing the 15 pane door and moving the window over so that I could have it up high enough to where my kitchen sink would be below the window. It was kind of determined that a four foot wide deck would be no more than a walkway. After this 106 degree weather and sitting on the front porch in full sun. I'm kind of thinking it would be nice to sit on that side of the house in the afternoon where there is no sun. It will also enable me to build the staircase to the right of that and not have it extend out past the deck. Which would be kind of a trip hazard as you are going back to the garden area. I am asking the Board to approve this pending the survey which is being worked on right now to join both the lot of my house and the lot right next to it. This deck will indeed go into the other lot. I just have to have a survey created that puts both properties together and they are doing that right now. In a week or two it will be completed and filed with the City. But I do own both lots and they were both on the same deed actually. The second

item is to install a stain glass window above the 15 pane door. I think its architectural appropriate. I think by doing this you would increase my workload by three quarters of a day and with the heat maybe a day and a half. I have to disassemble all of the siding, door trim and buy new door trim to go high up for the window. I think it will look good. I kind of fell into this window someone was willing to sell it and I bought it. What I will do with this window is I will put battle glass on both sides so that if anybody throws a rock it doesn't break the stain glass. The grey area that you are seeing right now is just the shading. But it is all grey and that is actually a 75 dollar a gallon paint and it is waterproof. I am testing to see how long it is going to last for the house. If it does then I will start using it a lot more. I think the waterproof will extend out the life of the siding on these houses. All that siding was taken down piece by piece was sanded, stripped, primed, sanded again and installed and the nails were filled. It will get painted a third time once the deck is on. As soon as I find the windows for the section on the right that section will come off and it will look like the kitchen area. The third item I am going to install is gutters. I don't have a picture of gutters just drive down Chestnut and you will see gutters across the street and next to me. They will be standard gutters. The gutters that were actually on this house were ruined. When my guys were working back there about two years ago I told them you can either move the gutters or don't walk on them. They walked all over them and they ruined them all. I need them installed on the front of the porch, water is just coming in and runs down on the front porch. I will probably need a wider gutter than what was on their originally because there is a tremendous amount of water there right now. It would still just be standard gutters.

Mr. Davis stated so you are talking about a 6 inch gutter instead of a 4 inch?

Mr. Meder stated yeah. The volume of water is such that I can fill up a 55 gallon container off the porch in 20 minutes.

Mrs. Stillwell stated how large is the stain glass window?

Mr. Meder stated it's a perfect fit if you see the molding on either side of the door that will just continue up the way it is now.

Mrs. Stillwell stated so it's not going to be a lot larger or a lot smaller?

Mr. Meder stated no, whatever they call the trim work on the side of your door I had 16 foot pieces that I cut down for the door. If I had that glass I wouldn't have had to cut them down. I also wouldn't have put the siding up there either.

Mrs. Stillwell stated the window to the right of the door is that going to stay there?

Mr. Meder stated yes. That window was where the door was.

Mrs. Stillwell stated okay.

Mr. Meder stated it will be over the double sink.

Mr. Nicholas closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Nicholas stated staff why do you believe that the gutters do not meet the guidelines?

Mrs. Burton stated the guidelines for gutters specifically state it is to be replacement if possible. Also, that the material use is to be copper, tern metal or aluminum. I wasn't certain of the material that he was going to use at the time of the application.

Mr. Nicholas stated Mr. Meder what material will you be using for the gutters?

Mr. Meder stated aluminum.

Mr. Nicholas stated so you are in agreement that if he using aluminum that they meet the guidelines.

Mrs. Burton stated yes.

Mr. Nicholas stated so it seems to me as far as staff is considered that items 1 and 3 meet the guidelines. Item 2 why do you believe that is does not meet the guidelines?

Mrs. Burton stated number 2 does not meet the guidelines specifically because it states that it is an item that is not currently present. There is no stain glass present in this particular structure.

Mr. Nicholas stated however you guys want to handle this.

Mr. Weir stated in the period that this house was built stain glass was everywhere.

Mrs. Stillwell stated it seems to be period appropriate material.

Mr. Weir stated yes. It is all over town.

Mr. Nicholas stated I agree with you I think staff position is the way that the standards are worded that if it's not there now then you shouldn't put it there.

Mrs. Stillwell stated well it is a south facing exposure and you want as much light as you can have coming into the kitchen. You really want that light to come into a kitchen in the morning it would be beautiful with that glass.

Mrs. Stillwell made a motion to approve *PLCAR2016000197 with the condition that the lots be joined together in one legal description by the City Zoning, that the Stain Glass window be installed and the aluminum gutters as long as they are*

the 6 inch that are capable of handling the water load of that roof. Mr. Weir seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a 5-0.

2. Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness, PLCAR20160000208, filed by William and Elizabeth Hagan to replace wood front porch flooring with Aeratis Heritage composite porch plank at 826 Green Street.

Mr. Nicholas opened the Public Hearing.

Present on behalf of this request was William Hagan, the applicant. Mr. Hagan stated we would like to replace the wooden porch decking which is a real maintenance nightmare. We want to replace it with a product that is made specifically for the restoration market. I bought a piece with me. It is the same dimensions of the existing tongue and groove.

Mr. Nicholas stated is this just for the floor?

Mr. Hagan stated yes. I also have a letter from the State of Louisiana Lieutenant Governor's Office approving this material for all of their Historical property in the State of Louisiana.

Mr. Nicholas stated can you see the porch from the public right-of-way?

Mrs. Burton stated yes.

Mr. Hagan stated you can because of the elevation it's slightly higher but you really have to approach the property to see it. This is the letter here. Being expensive doesn't make it appropriate but it is expensive. I think we will end up with a much better look. I think it is consistent with what is there in appearance what we wouldn't have is the maintenance issues that you can see where the water drains from the roof.

Mr. Steve Wilson stated I want to be here to comment on plastic flooring. What I wanted to mention is that one of the issues and part of this process is fairness. About a year ago Micah Robinson presented replacing the floor of 879 Pine Street with treated wood not plastic but treated and it was turned down. In fact the owner of that house is still unhappy about all of the issues and he has been attacked for trying to do things. He didn't propose plastic wood and in fact he was rejected as I recall the floors were wider. I don't have any problem with the same width boards. But I think what you need to realize is that you all have already set a precedent so it would be helpful to notify people that they can replace their porches with composite boards as long as they are the same width. If that is true I would like to tell Micah Robinson that he can finish repairing his porch.

Mr. Nicholas stated there are a couple of issues with the comments that you raised. First, we are not like the Supreme Court unfortunately when we decide one case it is not binding on all other cases we can consider each one as they are presented. Let me ask the applicant first is this going to be the same width board?

Mr. Hagan stated it is yes.

Mr. Nicholas stated so you are not asking to change the size?

Mr. Hagan stated I'm not that is the board that I would be using. It is also the same dimensions as the existing.

Mr. Nicholas stated it is the same dimensions as the existing so literally we are just changing the material?

Mr. Hagan stated right.

Mr. Nicholas stated let me ask staff do you recall the record of whatever meeting 879 Pine Street was?

Mrs. Burton stated 879 Pine Street the request was to remove tongue and groove decking and to replace it with treated deck board. No longer would it be tongue and groove, it would change the profile and the view from the street as well as the actually width itself.

Mr. Nicholas stated is this tongue and groove?

Mrs. Burton stated yes that's tongue and groove.

Mr. Nicholas stated we don't have an apples to apples comparison is what I am hearing from staff.

Mrs. Burton stated no it was different.

Mr. Davis stated the house we are talking about is the same one where Micah said that he was actually going to rip the boards?

Mrs. Burton stated he did actually come back and bring a sample to show everyone the tightness.

Mr. Davis stated so it wasn't going to be the round over round material that Mr. Meder was looking at it was going to be a close replica.

Mr. Weir stated we did approve that?

Mrs. Burton stated ultimately you did.

Mr. Davis stated but the reason why we didn't the first time was because there were other structural issues that were taking place at the house.

Mrs. Burton stated it was tabled upon first review for him to bring back samples.

Mr. Nicholas stated I'm hearing that even if a precedent was set it is not the same thing.

Mr. Meder stated I wasn't here for the approval of Micah's treated lumber if you butt two pieces of treated lumber up against each other and ripped them down to the same size as this. What is going to happen with treated lumber is that it is going to shrink. Eventually there is going to be a gap in his porch.

Mr. Davis stated if I remember correctly he was getting kiln dried versus the Lowes.

Mr. Meder stated it sounds like he should have just went out and bought this regular tongue and groove instead of treated. But this is exactly what we need to be using. This is probably about eight times the cost of Pine.

Mr. Hagan stated it will be about 2500 in materials.

Mr. Nicholas stated will this last?

Mr. Meder stated yeah you will never have to paint it.

Mr. Nicholas stated so in the long run it will save money.

Mr. Meder stated it's not going to warp, it may crack when it is nailed I don't know. Yeah this is what we need to be using it will extend the life of our porches.

Mrs. Stillwell the porches are very important they define the Old West End. I've never had a wooden porch or deck in the Old West End. It is just a constant battle with the heat, cold and the rain and trying to keep these porches. The flooring just doesn't last.

Mr. Nicholas closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Nicholas stated it seems to me that this material is absolutely prohibited by the guidelines but that is exactly why we have that second vote because that's exactly what we need.

Mr. Weir made a motion that the request does not meet the guidelines. Mr. Stowe seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a 5-0 vote.

Mr. Weir made a motion that we approve this request that it does not have an adverse effect on the neighborhood or property. Mrs. Stillwell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a 5-0 vote.

APPROVAL OF THE MINTUES

Mr. Weir made a motion to approve the June 23, 2016 minutes. Mr. Davis seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Mrs. Burton stated the first thing is that 864 Pine Street is now complete. I don't know if you guys have had time to go by and see that property. 124 Chestnut Street is now under construction the porch is being removed and new decking is on the porch now. Then they will be working on the roof. Five Forks that project was actually completed today I can show you some pictures afterward. The openings that were created from the demolition of that additional staircase and some opening that needed to be secured those were secured and then it was kind of a hodgepodge of paint colors and that has all been painted to a uniform color that looks very nice. The grass is growing pretty well; there are a couple of bald spots. It's really hot so we can't expect but so much we will reseed in the fall. National Night out is August the 2nd.

Mr. Paul Liepe stated I just wanted to remind the Commission Tuesday August 2nd is National Night Out. I understand we have a tremendous number of neighborhoods in Danville is going to participate in this year's event. The Old West End will be having an event an ice cream celebration. I use the word celebration because we are actually holding this on the newly sown grass at Five Forks at the site of the old bakery. So that we can celebrate the improvements that have been made there up and down Pine Street; there is so much going on so we are going to have a little bit of ice cream to celebrate. So you all can come and join us.

Mrs. Stillwell stated what time is it going to be?

Mr. Liepe stated 7:15 until dark Susan.

Mrs. Burton stated also the City of Danville has received a CLG grant for the rehabilitation of 221 Jefferson Avenue this is the Bryant Heard home; the little brick house that sits on Jefferson two doors down from the apartment complex.

Mrs. Stillwell stated Sam Kushner owned that I think.

Mrs. Burton stated oh really? This house will be a rehab of the interior and the exterior. We received a 25,000 dollar grant to help with that project. We have also received a Cost Share Grant from the Virginia Department of Historic Resources to do Architectural survey. Last year we did from the West Main corridor all the way to Ballou Park. This will actually fill in a little bit of the gaps we are actually going to go down Stuart Street, Montague and Mount Vernon. So you should see those guys out. The bid and proposals are out now. We hope to get that started in September.

Mrs. Stillwell stated I have a question. I have heard some rumors I don't know 870 Pine Street which had been Joe Garrett's property apartments. They were really poorly maintained is that safe at this point or is that demolition planned?

Mrs. Burton stated we have no demolitions planned. The properties that are owned by the Housing Authority the intent is to purchase them and rehab them to revive the community not for demolition. Now with that said we all know what kind of condition some of these properties may be in. But I can tell you right now there is no intent.

Mrs. Stillwell stated the other question I had was were you able to share the photos of Hagan's Drug Store with the CAR?

Mrs. Burton stated I did.

Mrs. Stillwell stated Gary Grant did that for me and that was Mr. Hagan on the white horse in front of the building with the side porch just like the Ferrell building. You think there will ever be anyway we can get that stairwell or porch back up there?

Mrs. Burton stated within the next two weeks or so we will have structural analysis begin on that property. Once this begins we should have an application to come before you about the removal of some of the facade for some investigation. We did receive that grant so we are ready to move forward on that. You will see that next month so we can start removing that and see what is left. I know when the painting was completed this week the mortar is extremely sandy. So I don't know how soft the brick may be behind the façade.

Mrs. Stillwell stated you can see a lot of brick at the top that is exposed I don't know who took the prima stone down.

Mrs. Burton stated it was an Act of God. We are just glad no one was hurt.

With no further business the meeting adjourned at 3:59 p.m.

Approved